

August 2002

SCH No. 2000061113

ULTRAMAR, INC.

WILMINGTON REFINERY

CARB PHASE 3 PROPOSED PROJECT

FINAL SUBSEQUENT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT

VOLUME IV: Responses to Comments

Executive Officer

Barry Wallerstein, D. Env.

Deputy Executive Officer,

Planning, Rule Development, and Area Sources

Elaine Chang, DrPH

Assistant Deputy Executive Officer,

Planning, Rule Development, and Area Sources

Laki Tisopulos, Ph.D, P.E.

Planning and Rules Manager,

CEQA and Socioeconomic Analysis

Susan Nakamura

Submitted to:

SOUTH COAST AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Prepared by:

ENVIRONMENTAL AUDIT, INC.

Reviewed by: Steve Smith, Ph.D. - Program Supervisor
Frances Keeler - Senior Deputy District Counsel
Kathy Stevens – Air Quality Specialist

**SOUTH COAST AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT GOVERNING
BOARD**

Chairman: NORMA J. GLOVER
Councilmember, City of Newport Beach
Cities Representative, Orange County

Vice Chairman: DR. WILLIAM A. BURKE, Ed.D.
Speaker of the Assembly Representative

MEMBERS

MICHAEL D. ANTONOVICH
Supervisor, Fifth District
Los Angeles County Representative

HAL BERNSON
Councilmember, City of Los Angeles
Cities Representative, Los Angeles County, Western Region

JANE CARNEY
Senate Rules Committee Appointee

BEATRICE J. S. LAPISTO – KIRTLEY
Councilmember, City of Bradbury
Cities Representative, Los Angeles County, Eastern Region

RONALD O. LOVERIDGE
Mayor, City of Riverside
Cities Representative, Riverside County

JON D. MIKELS
Supervisor, Second District
San Bernardino County Representative

LEONARD PAULITZ
Mayor Pro Tem, City of Montclair
Cities Representative, San Bernardino County

JAMES A. SILVA.
Supervisor, Second District
Orange County Representative

CYNTHIA VERDUGO-PERALTA
Governor's Appointee

S. ROY WILSON, Ed.D.
Supervisor, Fourth District
Riverside County Representative

EXECUTIVE OFFICER

BARRY WALLERSTEIN, D. Env.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ULTRAMAR INC. WILMINGTON REFINERY CARB PHASE 3 PROPOSED PROJECT SUBSEQUENT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT

VOLUME IV: RESPONSE TO COMMENTS

	Page No.
INTRODUCTION	1
COMMENT LETTERS AND RESPONSE TO COMMENT LETTERS	
City of Anaheim.....	2
Response to City of Anaheim	3
Letter from Southern California Association of Governments.....	4
Response to Southern California Association of Governments.....	5
Letter from Wilmington Coalition for a Safe Environment	6
Response to Wilmington Coalition for a Safe Environment	9
Letter from California State Lands Commission.....	12
Response to California State Lands Commission	15
Letter from Port of Los Angeles	18
Response to Port of Los Angeles.....	20
Letter from Palos Verdes/South Bay Audubon Society	22
Response to Palos Verdes/South Bay Audubon Society	24
Letter from Communities for a Better Environment	30
Response to Communities for a Better Environment	55
Letters from the Public Submitted by Communities for a Better Environment	95
Response to the Public	141
Letter from Wilmington Coalition for a Safe Environment	153
Response to Wilmington Coalition for a Safe Environment	156
Letter from Ms. Anita Ponce	163
Response to Ms. Anita Ponce	165
Letters from Local Community	169
Response to the Local Community	184
Letter from Mr. Paul Garcia	190
Response to Mr. Paul Garcia	191
Letters from Local Community	194
Response to Local Community.....	206
Letter from Anita Logan and Manuel.....	209
Response to Anita Logan and Manuel.....	211
Letter from Vicky Concha Garcia	214
Response to Vicky Concha Garcia	215

TABLE OF CONTENTS
VOLUME IV: RESPONSE TO COMMENTS

	Page No.
Letters from Local Community	218
Response to Local Community.....	231
Letters from Local Community	234
Response to Local Community.....	244
Letter from Lydia Roberts and Evelia Rodriguez.....	248
Response to Lydia Roberts and Evelia Rodriguez.....	250
Letter from Mr. and Mrs. Boke.....	253
Response to Mr. and Mrs. Boke	254
Letter from Local Community.....	259
Response to Local Community.....	277
Letter from Mr. and Mrs. Macias	280
Response to Mr. and Mrs. Macias	281
Letter from Cecilia Mora	285
Response from Cecilia Mora	286
Letter from Mrs. Rosie Villa.....	290
Response to Mrs. Rosie Villa	291
Letter from Mr. Ronnie Fematt.....	294
Response to Mr. Ronnie Fematt	295
Letter from Mr. and Mrs. Concha Ponce	299
Response to Mr. and Mrs. Concha Ponce.....	300
Letter from Govenor’s Office of Planning and Research	302a
Response to Govenor’s Office of Planning and Research.....	302c
Letters from Community	304
Response to Community.....	313
Letter from Mr. David Marquez	314
Response to Mr. David Marquez.....	315
Letters from Eddie Mora and Carlos Zuniga.....	316
Response to Eddie Mora and Carlos Zuniga	318
Letters from Alma Hernandez, Valero Gage, and Saul Villicana	319
Response to Alma Hernandez, Valero Gage, and Saul Villicana.....	322
Letter from Walter Eddie Greenwood	323
Response to Walter Eddie Greenwood.....	324
Letter from Community	325
Response to Community.....	329
Letters from Community	330
Response to Community.....	339
Letter from Ms. Esperanze Heredia.....	341
Response to Ms. Esperanze Heredia.....	342
Letter from Daniel Ruvalcaba.....	343
Response to Daniel Ruvalcaba	344

TABLE OF CONTENTS
VOLUME IV: RESPONSE TO COMMENTS

	Page No.
Letter from Richard Suarez.....	345
Response to Richard Suarez	346
Letter from Francine Garcia	347
Response to Francine Garcia	348
Letter from Mr. and Mrs. Jesse Marquez Sr.....	349
Response to Mr. and Mrs. Jesse Marquez Sr.....	350
Letter from Fernando Ruvalcaba	351
Response to Fernando Ruvalcaba.....	352
Letter from Trish C. Salas.....	353
Response to Trish C. Salas	354
Letter from Rosa Carrasco.....	355
Response to Rosa Carrasco.....	356
Letter from Francisco Reyes.....	357
Response to Francisco Reyes.....	358
Letter from Mr. Juan Hernandez.....	359
Response to Mr. Juan Hernandez	360
Letter from Erica Concha	361
Response to Erica Concha	362
June 20, 2002 Letter from Stephanie Lee of CBE.....	363
Response to June 20, 2002 Letter from Stephanie Lee of CBE	365
June 20, 2002 Letter from Scott Kuhn of CBE.....	399
Response to June 20, 2002 Letter from Scott Kuhn of CBE	410
June 20, 2002 Letter from Maria Hall of CBE	421
Response to June 20, 2002 Letter from Maria Hall of CBE.....	448
June 25, 2002 Letter from Scott Kuhn of CBE.....	450
Response to June 25, 2002 Letter from Scott Kuhn of CBE	469
Letter from California Air Resources Board	472
Public Comments from June 20, 2002 Public Meeting	474

VOLUME IV

FINAL SUBSEQUENT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT

ULTRAMAR, INC. WILMINGTON REFINERY
CARB PHASE 3 PROPOSED PROJECT

RESPONSE TO COMMENTS

INTRODUCTION

This document, together with the Draft Subsequent Environmental Impact Report (Draft SEIR) Volumes I, II, and III, and Volume I, II and III of the Final Subsequent Environmental Impact Report (Final SEIR) constitutes the Final SEIR for the proposed Ultramar CARB Phase 3 Proposed Project.

The Draft SEIR was circulated a 45-day for public review and comment period on March 6, 2002 and is otherwise available at the South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD), 21865 E. Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, California 91765-4182 or by phone at (909) 396-3600. Portions of the DEIR can also be downloaded by contacting the SCAQMD's CEQA web pages at <http://www.aqmd.gov/ceqa/nonaqmd.html>.

The Draft SEIR contained a detailed project description, the environmental setting for each environmental resource where the NOP determined there was a potential significant impact, an analysis of the potentially significant environmental impacts, including cumulative impacts, project alternatives, and other areas of discussion as required by CEQA. The discussion of environmental impacts included a detailed analysis of air quality, geology/soil, hazards and hazardous materials, hydrology/water quality, land use/planning, noise, solid/hazardous waste, and transportation/traffic.

The SCAQMD received about 149 comment letters on the Draft EIR during the public comment period. An additional 41 letters were received after the close of the public comment period. Responses to each comment letter are presented in this Volume. Also, comments received at the June 20, 2002 public meeting are included and responses provided to those comments.