



South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178
(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

SENT VIA USPS AND E-MAIL:

May 11, 2017

darvizo@rcplma.org

Daniel Arvizo, Project Planner
Riverside County Planning Department – Palm Desert
77-588 El Duna Ct., Suite H
Mailstop #: 1070
Palm Desert, CA 92211

Site Plan Consultation for the Plot Plan 26242 – EA43015

The South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD) staff appreciates the opportunity to comment on the above-mentioned project. The SCAQMD staff's comments are recommendations regarding the analysis of potential air quality impacts from the proposed project that should be included in the CEQA document. Please forward a copy of the CEQA document directly to SCAQMD at the address in our letterhead. **In addition, please send with the CEQA document all appendices or technical documents related to the air quality, health risk, and greenhouse gas analyses and electronic versions of all air quality modeling and health risk assessment files¹. These include emission calculation spreadsheets and modeling input and output files (not PDF files). Without all files and supporting documentation, SCAQMD staff will be unable to complete a review of the air quality analyses in a timely manner. Any delays in providing all supporting documentation will require additional time for review beyond the end of the comment period.**

Air Quality Analysis

The SCAQMD adopted its California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Air Quality Handbook in 1993 to assist other public agencies with the preparation of air quality analyses. The SCAQMD recommends that the Lead Agency use this Handbook as guidance when preparing its air quality analyses. Copies of the Handbook are available from the SCAQMD's Subscription Services Department by calling (909) 396-3720. More recent guidance developed since this Handbook was published is also available on SCAQMD's website here: [http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/ceqa-air-quality-handbook-\(1993\)](http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/ceqa-air-quality-handbook-(1993)). SCAQMD staff also recommends that the Lead Agency use the CalEEMod land use emissions software. This software has recently been updated to incorporate up-to-date state and locally approved emission factors and methodologies for estimating pollutant emissions from typical land use development. CalEEMod is the only software model maintained by the California Air Pollution Control Officers Association (CAPCOA) and replaces the now outdated URBEMIS. This model is available free of charge at: www.caleemod.com.

The SCAQMD has also developed both regional and localized significance thresholds. The SCAQMD staff requests that the Lead Agency quantify criteria pollutant emissions and compare the results to the recommended regional significance thresholds found here: <http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/ceqa/handbook/scaqmd-air-quality-significance-thresholds.pdf>. In addition to analyzing regional air quality impacts, the SCAQMD staff recommends calculating localized air quality impacts and

¹ Pursuant to the CEQA Guidelines Section 15174, the information contained in a CEQA document shall include summarized technical data, maps, plot plans, diagrams, and similar relevant information sufficient to permit full assessment of significant environmental impacts by reviewing agencies and members of the public. Placement of highly technical and specialized analysis and data in the body of a CEQA document should be avoided through inclusion of supporting information and analyses as appendices. Appendices may be prepared in volumes separate from the basic CEQA document, but shall be readily available for public examination and shall be submitted to all clearinghouses which assist in public review.

comparing the results to localized significance thresholds (LSTs). LST's can be used in addition to the recommended regional significance thresholds as a second indication of air quality impacts when preparing a CEQA document. Therefore, when preparing the air quality analysis for the proposed project, it is recommended that the Lead Agency perform a localized analysis by either using the LSTs developed by the SCAQMD or performing dispersion modeling as necessary. Guidance for performing a localized air quality analysis can be found at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/localized-significance-thresholds>.

The Lead Agency should identify any potential adverse air quality impacts that could occur from all phases of the proposed project and all air pollutant sources related to the proposed project. Air quality impacts from both construction (including demolition, if any) and operations should be calculated. Construction-related air quality impacts typically include, but are not limited to, emissions from the use of heavy-duty equipment from grading, earth-loading/unloading, paving, architectural coatings, off-road mobile sources (e.g., heavy-duty construction equipment) and on-road mobile sources (e.g., construction worker vehicle trips, material transport trips). Operation-related air quality impacts may include, but are not limited to, emissions from stationary sources (e.g., boilers), area sources (e.g., solvents and coatings), and vehicular trips (e.g., on- and off-road tailpipe emissions and entrained dust). Air quality impacts from indirect sources, such as sources that generate or attract vehicular trips, should be included in the analysis.

In the event that the proposed project generates or attracts vehicular trips, especially heavy-duty diesel-fueled vehicles, it is recommended that the Lead Agency perform a mobile source health risk assessment. Guidance for performing a mobile source health risk assessment (“*Health Risk Assessment Guidance for Analyzing Cancer Risk from Mobile Source Diesel Idling Emissions for CEQA Air Quality Analysis*”) can be found at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/mobile-source-toxics-analysis>. An analysis of all toxic air contaminant impacts due to the use of equipment potentially generating such air pollutants should also be included.

In addition, guidance on siting incompatible land uses (such as placing homes near freeways) can be found in the California Air Resources Board’s *Air Quality and Land Use Handbook: A Community Perspective*, which can be found at the following internet address: <http://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/handbook.pdf>. CARB’s Land Use Handbook is a general reference guide for evaluating and reducing air pollution impacts associated with new projects that go through the land use decision-making process. Guidance² on strategies to reduce air pollution exposure near high-volume roadways can be found at: https://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/rd_technical_advisory_final.PDF.

Project Specific Comments – Truck Trip Rates for High Cube Warehouse Projects

SCAQMD recommends the use of truck trip rates from the Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE) for high cube warehouse projects located in SCAQMD (i.e. 1.68 average daily vehicle trips per 1,000 square feet and 0.64 average daily truck trips per 1,000 square feet). Consistent with the CEQA Guidelines, the CEQA document may use a non-default trip rate if there is substantial evidence indicating another rate is more appropriate for the air quality analysis.

For high cube warehouse projects, the SCAQMD staff has been working on a Warehouse Truck Trip Study to better quantify trip rates associated with local warehouse and distribution projects, as truck emission represent more than 90 percent of air quality impacts from these projects. Details regarding this

² In April 2017, ARB published a technical advisory, *Strategies to Reduce Air Pollution Exposure Near High-Volume Roadways: Technical Advisory*, to supplement ARB’s Air Quality and Land Use Handbook: A Community Health Perspective. This Technical Advisory is intended to provide information on strategies to reduce exposures to traffic emissions near high-volume roadways to assist land use planning and decision-making in order to protect public health and promote equity and environmental justice. Available at: <https://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/landuse.htm>.

study can be found online here: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/high-cube-warehouse>.

Mitigation Measures

In the event that the proposed project generates significant adverse air quality and health risk impacts, CEQA requires that all feasible mitigation measures that go beyond what is required by law be utilized during project construction and operation to minimize these impacts. Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines §15126.4 (a)(1)(D), any impacts resulting from mitigation measures must also be discussed. Several resources are available to assist the Lead Agency with identifying possible mitigation measures for the proposed project, including:

- Chapter 11 of the SCAQMD *CEQA Air Quality Handbook*
- SCAQMD's CEQA web pages at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/mitigation-measures-and-control-efficiencies>.
- SCAQMD's Rule 403 – Fugitive Dust, and the Implementation Handbook for controlling construction-related emissions
- CAPCOA's *Quantifying Greenhouse Gas Mitigation Measures* available here: <http://www.capcoa.org/wp-content/uploads/2010/11/CAPCOA-Quantification-Report-9-14-Final.pdf>.
- Other measures to reduce air quality impacts from land use projects can be found in the SCAQMD's Guidance Document for Addressing Air Quality Issues in General Plans and Local Planning. This document can be found at the following internet address: <http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/planning/air-quality-guidance/complete-guidance-document.pdf>.

Additional mitigation measures for operational air quality impacts from mobile sources that the Lead Agency should consider may include the following:

- Require the use of 2010 compliant diesel trucks, or alternatively fueled, delivery trucks (e.g., food, retail and vendor supply delivery trucks) at commercial/retail sites upon project build-out. If this isn't feasible, consider other measures such as incentives, phase-in schedules for clean trucks, etc.
- Have truck routes clearly marked with trailblazer signs, so that trucks will not enter residential areas.
- Limit the daily number of trucks allowed at the facility to levels analyzed in the Draft EIR. If higher daily truck volumes are anticipated to visit the site, the Lead Agency should commit to re-evaluating the proposed project through CEQA prior to allowing this land use or higher activity level.
- Provide electric vehicle (EV) Charging Stations (see the discussion below under "f." regarding EV charging stations).
- Should the proposed project generate significant regional emissions, the Lead Agency should require mitigation that requires accelerated phase-in for non-diesel powered trucks. For example, natural gas trucks, including Class 8 HHD trucks, are commercially available today. Natural gas trucks can provide a substantial reduction in health risks, and may be more financially feasible today due to reduced fuel costs compared to diesel. In the Final CEQA document, the Lead Agency should require a phase-in schedule for these cleaner operating trucks to reduce project impacts. The SCAQMD staff is available to discuss the availability of current and upcoming truck technologies and incentive programs with the Lead Agency and project applicant.
- Trucks that can operate at least partially on electricity have the ability to substantially reduce the significant NOx impacts from this project. Further, trucks that run at least partially on electricity are projected to become available during the life of the project as discussed in the 2016-2040

Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy (2016-2040 RTP/SCS)³. It is important to make this electrical infrastructure available when the project is built so that it is ready when this technology becomes commercially available. The cost of installing electrical charging equipment onsite is significantly cheaper if completed when the project is built compared to retrofitting an existing building. Therefore, the SCAQMD staff recommends the Lead Agency require the proposed warehouse and other plan areas that allow truck parking to be constructed with the appropriate infrastructure to facilitate sufficient electric charging for trucks to plug-in. Similar to the City of Los Angeles requirements for all new projects, the SCAQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency require at least 5% of all vehicle parking spaces (including for trucks) include EV charging stations⁴. Further, electrical hookups should be provided at the onsite truck stop for truckers to plug in any onboard auxiliary equipment. At a minimum, electrical panels should appropriately sized to allow for future expanded use.

- Create a buffer zone of at least 300 meters (roughly 1,000 feet), which can be office space, employee parking, greenbelt, etc. between the warehouse/distribution center and sensitive receptors.
- Design the warehouse/distribution center such that entrances and exits are such that trucks are not traversing past neighbors or other sensitive receptors.
- Design the warehouse/distribution center such that any check-in point for trucks is well inside the facility property to ensure that there are no trucks queuing outside of the facility.
- Design the warehouse/distribution center to ensure that truck traffic within the facility is located away from the property line(s) closest to its residential or sensitive receptor neighbors.
- Restrict overnight parking in residential areas.
- Establish overnight parking within the warehouse/distribution center where trucks can rest overnight.
- Establish area(s) within the facility for repair needs.
- Develop, adopt and enforce truck routes both in and out of city, and in and out of facilities.
- Have truck routes clearly marked with trailblazer signs, so trucks will not enter residential areas.

Additional mitigation measures for operational air quality impacts from other area sources that the Lead Agency should consider may include the following:

- Maximize use of solar energy including solar panels; installing the maximum possible number of solar energy arrays on the building roofs and/or on the Project site to generate solar energy for the facility.
- Maximize the planting of trees in landscaping and parking lots.
- Use light colored paving and roofing materials.
- Utilize only Energy Star heating, cooling, and lighting devices, and appliances.
- Install light colored “cool” roofs and cool pavements.
- Limit the use of outdoor lighting to only that needed for safety and security purposes.
- Require use of electric or alternatively fueled sweepers with HEPA filters.
- Use of water-based or low VOC cleaning products.

Alternatives

In the event that the proposed project generates significant adverse air quality and health risks impacts, CEQA requires the consideration and discussion of alternatives to the project or its location which are

³ Southern California Association of Governments. Available at: <http://scagrtpsc.net/Pages/FINAL2016RTPSCS.aspx>

⁴ City of Los Angeles. Available at: http://ladbs.org/LADBSWeb/LADBS_Forms/Publications/LAGreenBuildingCodeOrdinance.pdf

capable of avoiding or substantially lessening any of the significant effects of the project. The discussion of a reasonable range of potentially feasible alternatives, including a “no project” alternative, is intended to foster informed decision-making and public participation. Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15126.6(d), the Draft EIR shall include sufficient information about each alternative to allow meaningful evaluation, analysis, and comparison with the proposed project.

Permits

In the event that the proposed project requires a permit from SCAQMD, SCAQMD should be identified as a responsible agency for the proposed project in the CEQA document. Permit questions concerning storage tanks, dispensing nozzles, etc., can be directed to SCAQMD Engineering and Permitting staff at (909) 396-2551⁵. For general information on permits, please visit the SCAQMD webpage at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/permits>. General permitting questions can be directed to SCAQMD Engineering and Permitting staff at (909) 396-3385.

Data Sources

SCAQMD rules and relevant air quality reports and data are available by calling the SCAQMD’s Public Information Center at (909) 396-2039. Much of the information available through the Public Information Center is also available via the SCAQMD’s webpage (<http://www.aqmd.gov>).

The SCAQMD staff is available to work with the Lead Agency to ensure that project air quality impacts are accurately evaluated and mitigated where feasible. If you have any questions regarding the comments, please contact Jack Cheng, Air Quality Specialist, CEQA IGR, at (909) 396-2448.

Sincerely,

Lijin Sun

Lijin Sun, J.D.

Program Supervisor, CEQA IGR

Planning, Rule Development & Area Sources

LS:JC

RVC170509-08

Control Number

⁵ South Coast Air Quality Management District. *Helpful Web Links for Gasoline Dispensing Facilities (GDFs)*. Available at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/compliance/gasoline-dispensing2/helpful-web-links-for-gdfs>.