



Assembly Bill (AB) 617 Community Air Initiatives

Wilmington, Carson, West Long Beach Community Steering Committee Meeting #9

Wednesday, August 7, 2019
 CSC Meeting 10:00 a.m. – 12:30 p.m.
 Carson Event Center
 801 E. Carson St., Carson, CA 90745

Time	Item	Presenter	Why is this important?
9:30 am	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Doors Open 		
10:00 am	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Welcoming Remarks Announcements Meeting #8 Recap & Current Progress: What we've done so far – 15 min 	Facilitator	To understand where we are in developing the community plans
10:15 am	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Stationary Source Committee Meeting Recap and Governing Board Process Overview – 15 min Committee Discussion – 10 min 	Jo Kay Ghosh <i>(Director of Community Air Programs, South Coast AQMD)</i> Committee Members	To provide a recap of the Stationary Source Committee Meeting and provide information on the Governing Board process
10:40 am	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Draft Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP) and Emissions Reduction Targets* – 20 min Committee Discussion – 45 min 	Jo Kay Ghosh <i>(Director of Community Air Programs, South Coast AQMD)</i> Committee Members	To provide an update on revisions of the Draft CERP based on comments received To provide information on the emissions reduction targets
11:45 am	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Community Air Monitoring Highlights* – 10 min Committee Discussion – 15 min 	Payam Pakbin <i>(Advanced Monitoring Technologies Program Supervisor, South Coast AQMD)</i> Committee Members	To provide an update on the current monitoring efforts being deployed in the community
12:10 pm	Next Meeting Topics and Important Reminders – 5 min	Facilitator Committee Members	
12:15 pm	Public Comment – 15 min	Members of the Public	
12:30 pm	Adjourn		

* Staff is also available for questions after the meeting.



South Coast
AQMD

Assembly Bill (AB) 617 Community Air Initiatives

Wilmington, Carson, West Long Beach
Community Workshop and Community Steering Committee Meeting #9

Wednesday, August 7, 2019

CSC Meeting 10:00 a.m. – 12:30 p.m.

Carson Event Center; 801 E. Carson St., Carson, CA 90745

Affiliation	Representative (Primary ¹ , Secondary ²)	Participant in the Committee Meeting Discussion
Category: Community Organization		
Century Villages at Cabrillo	Jeffery Tate	
Coalition for a Safe Environment	Jesse Marquez ¹ , Rick Pulido ²	Jesse Marquez
Communities for a Better Environment	Alicia Rivera ¹ , Ashley Hernandez ²	Alicia Rivera
Long Beach Alliance for Children with Asthma	Sylvia Betancourt ¹ , Maria Reyes ²	
Los Cerritos Neighborhood Association	Gary Hamrick ¹ , Joe Hower ²	
Philippine Action Group for the Environment	Fe P. Koons	Fe P. Koons
SBCC Thrive LA	Maribel Alejandre ¹ , Leticia Herrera ²	Maribel Alejandre
Category: Active Resident (city indicated below)		
Carson	Daniel Toledo	
Carson	Sergio Franco	
Carson	Joseph Luis Piñon ¹ , Yasaman Houshang ²	
Carson	William Koons	William Koons
West Long Beach	Christopher Chavez ¹ , Pastor Anthony Quezada ²	Christopher Chavez
West Long Beach	Jacob Broderick ¹ , Emelio Ramirez ²	
West Long Beach	Ron Batiste	
West Long Beach	Whitney Amaya	Whitney Amaya
Wilmington	Salvador Lara ¹ , Victor Ibarra ²	Salvador Lara
Wilmington	Flavio Mercado	
Wilmington	Dulce Altamirano	Dulce Altamirano
Wilmington	Magali Sanchez-Hall ¹ , Sylvia Arredondo ²	Sylvia Arredondo
Category: Agency or School		
City of Carson	Saied Naaseh ¹ , McKina Alexander ²	McKina Alexander
City of Los Angeles	Uduak-Joe Ntuk ¹ , Erica Blyther ²	Erica Blyther
Gulf Avenue Elementary School	Linda Bassett ¹ , Esperanza Romero ²	Linda Bassett
LA County Public Health	Matt Baca, Janet Scully	Matt Baca
Long Beach Public Health	Nelson Kerr ¹ , Judeth Luong ²	Judeth Luong
Long Beach Unified School District	Brooke Murray	
Port of Los Angeles	Tim DeMoss ¹ , Amber Coluso ²	Tim Demoss
University of Southern California	Jill Johnston	Jill Johnston
Category: Business, Business Organization, or Labor Organization		
Carson Chamber of Commerce	John Wogan ¹ , Ken Dami ²	John Wogan
Long Beach Area Chamber of Commerce	Jeremy Harris ¹ , Brissa Sotelo ²	
Wilmington Chamber of Commerce	Dan Hoffman ¹ , Cecilia Moreno ²	Dan Hoffman
Marathon Petroleum Company	Olga Chavez ¹ , Susan Stark ²	Susan Stark
Rail - Union Pacific	Lupe Valdez	
Trucking - Yusen Logistics	Cameron D. Smith ¹ , Nikki Nguyen ²	
Labor - USW Local 675	Pat Patterson	

Meeting Summary: During CSC Meeting #9, Jo Kay Ghosh (Director of Community Air Program, South Coast AQMD) provided a recap of the Stationary Source Committee Meeting and shared information on the Governing Board process. Jo Kay Ghosh also provided an update on the revisions being made to the Draft CERP revisions, based on prior committee feedback and comments received. Payam Pakbin (Advanced Monitoring Technologies Program Supervisor, South Coast AQMD) provided an update on the current monitoring efforts being deployed in the community.

- **Welcoming Remarks and Meeting #8 Recap & Current Progress: What We've Done So Far** –Valerie Martinez (Facilitator)
 - Valerie Martinez (Facilitator) started the meeting at 10:08 am. She reviewed housekeeping items and made a few announcements. She introduced Peter Nguyen from UC Davis.
 - Peter Nguyen (UC Davis) introduced the program evaluation work that Professor Jonathan London is leading, under a contract with CARB. He is seeking input from the community through surveys and interviews.
 - Ryan Stromar (South Coast AQMD, Community Liaison) made an announcement about the upcoming community tour, which will be on Friday, August 9th and thanked everyone for their input. He noted that the tour is open to CSC members only.
 - Valerie Martinez discussed the purpose of AB 617 and went over the progress that has been made over the past several months.

- **Stationary Source Committee Meeting Recap and Governing Board Process Overview** – Jo Kay Ghosh (Director of Community Air Programs, South Coast AQMD)
 - Jo Kay Ghosh (Director of Community Air Programs, South Coast AQMD) provided a recap of the Stationary Source Committee meeting from July 2019, where she presented information about the CERP's for the year 1 AB 617 communities and key remaining issues.
 - Q and A on Stationary Source Committee:
 - Susan Stark (Marathon Petroleum Company) asked that South Coast AQMD continue working with year 1 communities to complete the source attribution analysis to identify sources that drive exposure risk.
 - Jill Johnston (University of Southern California) suggested identifying a method to quantify emission reductions through the CERP actions. She said regarding health metrics, there could be ways to use the air pollution data collected to understand exposures in the community.
 - Jo Kay responded that they will track progress and develop a methodology for quantifying emission reductions.
 - Jesse Marquez (Coalition for a Safe Environment) emphasized the need for measurable metrics in the plan.
 - Jo Kay responded that more metrics would be included, and that some of the existing metrics were based on CSC input.
 - Alicia Rivera (Communities for a Better Environment) commented that estimated emission reduction targets for refineries are not included in the Draft CERP. She said she sees that South Coast AQMD has made a lot progress regarding data that has been found, but she wants to know if the Fluxsense study has been included in this data. She said South Coast AQMD is not taking their responsibility seriously about real reductions in emissions.
 - Jo Kay stated that emission reduction targets are listed in Chapter 5 of the CERP. She said in the refinery section, there are various actions to reduce fugitive emissions, and cannot provide a numerical target at this time for those actions. Also, rule development actions

will result in emission reductions. She said part of the rule development process is to do an assessment to determine what the baseline is.

- Jo Kay stated that they will present the year 1 CERPs to the South Coast AQMD Governing Board on September 6, 2019 at 9:00 am at South Coast AQMD headquarters. She shared that the public may participate by providing public comment at this meeting.
- **Draft Community Emissions Reduction Plan and Emission Reduction Targets-** Jo Kay Ghosh (Director of Community Air Programs, South Coast AQMD)
 - Jo Kay Ghosh said all the comments they received are being reviewed and that staff are aiming to release the Draft Final CERP on August 30th, 2019. She briefly discussed the source attribution analysis and clarified that the emissions specified in this chapter do not reflect emission reductions from rules that are currently being developed.
 - Jo Kay discussed the CERP emission reduction targets. She said that incentive funding has been allocated for the AB 617 program and staff estimated a reduction of 40-50 tons per year of nitrogen oxides in the Wilmington, Carson, West Long Beach community, and a reduction of 0.5-0.6 tons per year of particulate matter (reflecting diesel PM, since these are primarily diesel replacement projects). She discussed fugitive emissions and she wants to find a method to track this progress with the CSC members.
 - Erica Blyther (City of Los Angeles) said the comments she submitted were not incorporated in the CERP Draft.
 - Jo Kay said they received the comments and they are working through the process to figure out if they can incorporate them.
 - Jill Johnston said it would be important to find targets for diesel and benzene. She also wants to identify what pollutants will be measured when it comes to fugitive emissions.
 - Jo Kay said staff can work on a target for diesel, and that for benzene, staff will be using monitoring data to help track progress.
 - Christopher Chavez (West Long Beach resident) said he appreciates the emission reduction targets for mobile source incentives. He wants to understand air toxics in the area and understand how they are included in this plan. He wants rules related to AB 617 communicated to the steering committee and he likes the idea of having an asthma management program as part of one of the actions for this community.
 - Jo Kay asked if he has suggestions for potential partners for the asthma management program.
 - Jesse Marquez mentioned the Long Beach Memorial Hospital would be helpful for the asthma program. He said we need a clear understanding of goals and metrics. He created an 8-page document that describes what is required in terms of metrics. He talked about the document that he created and gave examples of goals and objectives. He suggested that the refinery purchase a specific type of LADWP contract, so that there will never be a power failure.
 - Judeth Luong (Long Beach Public Health) said she wants to see an asthma case management program, because there were several programs they implemented in the past that showed improved health outcomes. She mentioned that these programs have been nationally recognized and that South Coast AQMD had provided funding support for these programs.
 - Jo Kay said several years ago there was an enormous settlement that provided funding toward community benefits programs such as the ones Judeth described, but the reality is that they don't have any similar funds at this time. She wants to identify appropriate funding sources or partner with other entities to create new programs.

- Judeth Luong suggested looking at the Port of Long Beach, because they have a list of agencies that are funded by them and they can support new programs.
- Alicia Rivera said AB 617 promised community's emission reductions and she wants a plan to be available first and then emission reductions identified. She said we don't need to wait for a regulation to figure out targets and metrics, and ways to achieve those targets. She wants a plan of action for targets and a way of achieving them and then a regulation.
 - Philip Fine (Deputy Executive Officer, South Coast AQMD) said they are working on this. For example, the plan specifies that for the work to amend Rule 1118, the plan has a metric of a 50% reduction in emissions. He said there are other rules the agency is working on that address some of her concerns, but not all of the rules are included in this plan, because we had initially heard that wasn't what the community wanted. Nonetheless, staff are continuing to work on these rules.
- Susan Stark said toxic air pollutants are important to keep in my mind for the source attribution. She wants to know if PM is the driving force with moving forward with the CERP measures. She said it is important to focus on the true contributors.
- William Koons (Carson Resident) said he saw no interest from South Coast AQMD regarding the truck idling issue. He said that the complaint system needs a tracking number and wants follow-up on his complaint. He also suggested a truck idling traffic mechanism to track where truck traffic is occurring.
 - Jo Kay said she remembered his comment about a particular truck incident, and they noted this area. She asked if this is a recurring issue so that they can determine if a potential idling enforcement sweep would be appropriate. She noted that all complaints already receive a complaint number, and that they discussed some improvements in complaint follow-up in Chapter 4 of the CERP. She also described how South Coast AQMD can work with the city on truck routing matters.
- William Koons said if there is a sweep, he wants feedback regarding what is found. He also mentioned that there is an increase in container storage yard and associated truck traffic and wants better interaction between railyards and trucks.
- Jesse Marquez said there needs to be a public health study as the goal and then they need to identify a baseline and metrics. He said they need both a long- and short-term health study. He said the CASPER study is a good example for what needs to be done in the short term. He suggested teaming up with USC for a long-term study.
 - Matt Baca asked Jesse Marquez to follow up with him about public health surveys.
- Sylvia Arredondo (Wilmington Resident) said she made comments online, but she also wanted to share in person that industries need to be held accountable, and suggested that agencies, refineries and oil well companies should be added to the plan, where it makes sense. She also agrees that there should be metrics and a year to year plan for reducing emissions. She said there should be stronger targets and we need to better protect community health.
- Christopher Chavez said we need to assign roles to polluters. He also said there are many warehouse facilities that are a magnet for truck pollution and even though they are not our priority, South Coast AQMD needs to look at what attracts pollution.
- Salvador Lara said there is a lot of traffic on Lomita Ave. and there are two large yards that are opening which will open up more truck traffic.
- Fe P. Koons said truck representatives should have been included in the committee and signs should be included in warehouses. She emphasized that there should be "no idling" signs in the neighborhood.

- Jo Kay said a logistics agency is represented on this committee and that South Coast AQMD does outreach to fleet owners to let them know about incentive programs to help them get cleaner technology.
- Crystal Reul-Chen (CARB) said they are putting more “no idling” signs and they are working with the City of Carson and other cities. They are also driving around neighborhoods looking at areas of concern. She said they are working with the city and the committee can contact South Coast AQMD or CARB regarding truck idling.
- Salvador Lara said the no idling signs by themselves are not helpful, because there is no law enforcement. He said they need police to patrol.
- Jesse Marquez complimented South Coast AQMD for putting the inventory together. He said there were chemicals that were surprisingly high. He said he wants to see improvements by local sources. He said it is important that the new rules and regulations will reduce benzene. He wants every company included in reductions. He said rules can be established whether it is through a partnership or utilizing a new technology.
- Susan Stark said we need to see where the money makes most sense regarding toxic air contaminants.
- Linda Bassett (Gulf Avenue Elementary School) shared a message from Joseph Pinon, which expressed the need to have the CSC meetings held outside of regular business hours. He said their voices are not being heard and he said the CERP needs to come before this committee for approval.
 - Jo Kay explained that the reason for having a daytime CSC meeting was because of requests from CSC members to vary the time of the meetings. She mentioned the survey of CSC members that was conducted early in the process. The survey results showed that CSC members preferred evening meetings but more than 60% also indicated that afternoon meetings worked for them. There were also requests to accommodate parents with children in school, who wanted the meetings during school hours. She said a majority of the meetings are in the evening and some are in the morning because they are trying to accommodate all of their requests.
 - John Wogan (Carson Chamber of Commerce) said he appreciates that the district is accommodating with the meeting times.
- Linda Bassett asked that the CERP include the 2500-foot setback for oil wells and she said the health study is very important. She also said there should be a statement in the CERP about sunseting fossil fuels.
- William Koons said he is dealing with a few companies with dangerous chemicals in the City of Carson. He said he wants these included in their mobile monitoring. He wants the street of Dominguez monitored as often as possible.
- Sylvia Arredondo asked if VOC’s were included in the toxic air contaminants. She said even they are small; they are really harmful.
 - Jo Kay replied that VOCs are among the toxic air contaminants included in the analysis. Also, fugitive emissions are being identified through the actions of this CERP.
 - Susan Stark mentioned that fugitive emissions are included in their annual emissions inventories.
- Whitney Amaya (West Long Beach) reminded everyone that facilities that are being expanded need to be included.
 - Susan Stark said she provided a presentation about this at the last meeting and she can provide the slides.

- **Community Air Monitoring Highlights** - Payam Pakbin (Program Supervisor, South Coast AQMD) and Olga Pikelnaya (Program Supervisor, South Coast AQMD)
 - Payam Pakbin provided updates on the monitoring that is being conducted in this community. He noted that data from the fixed monitoring stations is available through the web-based data display tool. He talked about the ongoing special project, the monitoring and inspection efforts in the West Rancho Dominguez industrial area. He discussed the mobile monitoring surveys that are being conducted to identify potential hotspots, focusing on areas where air quality concerns were identified. One mobile platform is equipped to investigate diesel PM and can measure black carbon, PM, and NOx (which are associated with diesel emissions). A different mobile platform measures VOCs, and Olga Pikelnaya will discussed these mobile measurement, including efforts at the refineries and discussed how Rule 1180 (Refinery Fenceline and Community Air Monitoring) will complement AB 617 efforts.
 - Olga Pikelnaya (Program Supervisor, South Coast AQMD) talked about the mobile platform that measures VOCs. The purpose of this type of monitoring is to help evaluate emissions from facilities and area sources, identify hotspots, detect leaks and assess community exposures to air toxics with a focus on air quality concerns related to refineries, oil wells, and the ports. She shared preliminary results from the data that has been collected in the community since July 2019. Additionally, she discussed the monitoring that will be implemented under Rule 1180, which will include refinery fenceline monitoring and community air monitoring. She mentioned that they are seeking input on the proposed Rule 1180 community air monitoring locations.
 - Payam Pakbin provided the link for Rule 1180 and the link to the community air monitoring website and the data display tool.
 - Q and A on Community Air Monitoring:
 - Jill Johnston wanted to know what timeframe the mobile monitoring represents and if speciation is provided.
 - Olga Pikelnaya said it takes 20-30 minutes to circumvent a facility such as refinery, and she said they provide speciation for certain VOC's.
 - Jesse Marquez wanted to know what the backup air quality monitoring is for the Rule 1180 fenceline monitors during bad weather.
 - Olga Pikelnaya said the mobile lab is capable of monitoring during poor weather. She said the fenceline monitoring has certain limitations, but for refineries they use other measurements and each refinery is required to provide information on backup equipment of what to do during bad weather conditions and outages in their Rule 1180 fenceline monitoring plans.
 - William Koons asked for clarification about which refinery is on the third map.
 - Olga Pikelnaya replied that it is Valero, Wilmington.
 - William Koons said the second map has a dark blue spot so he wasn't sure if they are from the refinery, traffic, or VOCs. He wanted to know what a dangerous level for total alkanes is.
 - Olga Pikelnaya said the map only shows VOC measurements. She said these are enhancements over normal levels.
 - Jo Kay said there is no threshold for comparison for total VOCs but some specific compounds do have health benchmarks available for comparison. Where these benchmarks are available, we will display them.
 - Andrea Polidori (Manager, South Coast AQMD) reiterated that a higher level can indicate a leak, which might trigger an investigation and/or subsequent enforcement

actions, but these are monitor surveys to determine if there is any impact in the community.

- McKina Alexander (City of Carson) wanted to know which facilities were shown in the examples.
 - Olga Pikelnaya clarified that these were Phillips 66 Wilmington, Marathon Carson, and Valero Wilmington.
- Linda Bassett asked if any monitoring will be done at night.
 - Olga Pikelnaya replied that they plan monitoring based on weather conditions and that the mobile platform is capable of measuring at night. She said staff do not announce when they will be monitoring. Moreover, the Rule 1180 fence line and community air monitors will conduct monitoring 24/7.
- Fe P. Koons (Philippine Action Group for the Environment) asked if the results of the measurements will be available by next meeting.
 - Olga Pikelnaya said they may not have everything, but more results will be available.
- **Next Meeting Topics and Important Reminders**
 - Valerie Martinez (Facilitator) went over a few brief announcements for upcoming meetings and CSC roster changes and noted that the mobile monitoring vehicle is displayed outside.
 - Q and A on Announcements:
 - Jesse Marquez said he wants a CSC meeting before the Board meeting so that the CSC can see it before it is presented.
 - Jo Kay replied that the documents will be accessible prior to the Board meeting. She said that staff are committed to continuing the work and conversation with the CSC despite not having another CSC meeting prior to the Board meeting.
 - Jesse Marquez said they are concerned because South Coast AQMD has not identified certain technologies, but the CSC members want to do a presentation to share these technologies.
 - Jo Kay replied that staff assess what technologies are available and noted that CSC members can follow up with CARB on the status of the clearinghouse to look at statewide technologies.
 - Philip Fine (Deputy Executive Officer, South Coast AQMD) noted that staff are currently in the middle of the rule making process, where this technology assessment is being done.
 - Jesse Marquez wants the opportunity to make recommendations.
 - Susan Stark asked if there is a date when this version will go to the board.
 - Jo Kay said they are still responding to comments and some of them will be in the new release. She said that the target release date is August 30th.
 - Dulce Altamirano (Wilmington Resident) wanted to know how much pollution will be reduced per year.
 - Philip Fine replied they have several refinery actions and rules they are addressing right now. He said some reductions are not possible to quantify at this time. However, they have a preliminary estimate of the tons of NOx reductions, but the rule making process for this rule is still ongoing.
 - Jo Kay asked Dulce if she wanted to include Proposed Rule 1109.1 as an action in the CERP. There were several nods indicating “yes” from the CSC members.
 - Alicia Rivera said she submitted new comments before the deadline and she wants them to be considered. She said she wants to know the amount of tons per day or year by the next

meeting. She wants to know when the regulation will lead to reductions. She wants a conference call so she can get to an understanding with South Coast AQMD.

- Philip Fine said that Proposed Rule 1109.1 was not included in the CERP because staff initially heard that the community didn't want that in the CERP. However, staff are committed to doing this work, and are open to ideas.
- Chris Chavez said the community feels it is difficult to understand the rulemaking process and they need a better understanding of how it plays into the CERP.

- **Public Comment**
 - A member of the public said there should be a documentation of emission reductions and encouraged that there be a plan going forward. He also wants to address health risks that are not cancer related.