



South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178
(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

DRAFT MINUTES JOINT MEETING OF THE ADVISORY COUNCIL AND THE SCIENTIFIC, TECHNICAL & MODELING PEER REVIEW ADVISORY GROUP

**Wednesday, October 5, 2022
10:00 am**

1. Welcome, Introduction, and Roll Calls

Ian MacMillan, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer/Planning, Rule Development and Implementation called the meeting to order at 10:01 a.m. For additional details on Agenda item 1, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 00:00.

2. Comply with AB 361 Requirements to Allow the Joint Meeting of the Advisory Council and the Scientific, Technical, and Modeling Peer Review Advisory Group to Meet Remotely

Barbara Baird, Chief Deputy Counsel, Legal, introduced the provisions that allow the joint meeting to be conducted remotely. The Advisory Group approved, 12-0. The STMPR Advisory Group approved, 9-0. For additional details on Agenda item 2, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 11:10.

3. Approval of Minutes for Advisory Council

Mr. MacMillan asked the Advisory Council for the approval of minutes from the August 10, 2022 meeting of the Advisory Council. No opposition was recorded. For additional details on Agenda item 3, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 18:55.

4. Approval of Minutes for Scientific, Technical, and Modeling Peer Review Advisory Group

Mr. MacMillan asked the STMPR Advisory Group for the approval of minutes from the May 31, 2022 meeting of the STMPR Advisory Group. No opposition was recorded. For additional details on Agenda item 4, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 20:20.

5. Advisory Council's Comments on the 2022 AQMP Health Effect Analysis

Eric Praske, Ph.D., Acting Program Supervisor, Planning Rule Development and Implementation, presented a summary of comments and feedback from the Advisory Council on the health effects analysis. For additional details on Agenda item 5, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 21:15.

Advisory Council/STMPR Advisory Group Member Comments:

Dr. Michael Kleinman commented that U.S. EPA's Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC), of which he is a member, is anticipating the finalization in December of its discussion of scientific issues related to the 2020 Ozone Integrated

Science Assessment. He indicated supportive evidence for a lower ozone standard and the associated implications for AQMP. He offered to summarize CASAC comments for the Advisory Group.

6. Updated Health Benefits and Incremental Costs Based on the Revised Draft 2022 AQMP

Henry Roman, Principal/Industrial Economics, Inc. (IEc), and Dr. I. Elaine Shen, Planning and Rules Manager/Planning Rule Development and Implementation, presented on the updated health benefits and incremental costs analyses, respectively, associated the Revised Draft 2022 AQMP. For additional details on Agenda item 6, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 28:48.

Advisory Council/STMPR Advisory Group Member Comments:

Ralph Morris commented that health effects were estimated for interim years while air quality modeling was not reported for interim years. Dr. Lee responded that year 2032 was modeled for the purpose of attainment demonstration for the Coachella Valley.

Bill La Marr asked about what value of statistical life (VSL) figure was assumed for the health benefits monetization analysis, and cited some different figures used by other agencies and how they differ from what is used in the health benefits analysis of 2022 AQMP. He further asked whether benefits are overstated relative to the costs and impacts on businesses in the region. Mr. MacMillan acknowledged that the overall costs are significant in the 2022 AQMP, but the benefits outweigh the costs over time. Mr. Roman responded by describing the methodology in developing VSL. Dr. Shen mentioned that the appendices in the Draft Socioeconomic Report include sensitivity analyses based on alternative VSLs.

David Rothbart and Mr. La Marr asked about grid capacity to meet future energy demand of electrification associated with control measures requiring zero-emission (ZE) technologies. Mr. MacMillan mentioned the concerted efforts across agencies at the state level and suggested that it is uncertain to what extent the possibility that shortfalls in electricity supply could be partially bridged by use of hydrogen fuel. Mr. La Marr suggested that an energy summit would allow businesses to offer considerations in the rollout of ZE infrastructure. Dr. Kleinman commented on the role of energy storage in ZE infrastructure. Mr. La Marr expressed concerns over ZE technology cost impacts and would like utilities providers to estimate the timeline and costs associated with attaining Senate Bill 100's clean energy goals. Ken Chawkins remarked that future utility expansion costs will likely get passed along to rate-payers.

Public Comments:

Dr. James Enstrom, Scientific Integrity Institute, challenged the estimates on premature death avoided by citing his own research and previously submitted written comments on the lack of health effects due to ozone and PM exposure, and requested to speak directly to Board Member Delgado.

Shayne Seever, Vista Metals, commented on the potential emissions of hydrogen generation and supply, especially when mixed with natural gas, and also whether this

possible outcome was studied in the emission projections. Mr. MacMillan responded that the evaluation of impacts on NOx emissions will be studied in conjunction with the rollout of hydrogen technology. Robert Silence, Optivus Technology, commented that if every home were equipped with its own solar generation and battery equipment, as to be incentivized by the Inflation Reduction Act, there would be virtually no need for infrastructure expansion to meet future electricity demand with regard to ZE technology. He further commented on the need to use only green hydrogen produced by electrolysis. Adrian Martinez, Earthjustice, commented that further investigation is needed on hydrogen and NOx emissions and suggested it to be done via the Clean Fuels Program Advisory Group. Mr. Martinez also suggested to include health benefits for on-site workers as industrial facilities switch to ZE alternatives.

Kathleen Wells, Project 21, asked whether demographics and small business were considered as variables in the cost-benefit analysis, citing an interview she had with a black owner/operator of a trucking business that was adversely impacted by federal trucking regulations.

7. Environmental Justice Analysis of Implementing the Revised Draft 2022 AQMP

Stefani Penn, Ph.D., Senior Associate/ IEC, presented on environmental justice by examining the distribution of health benefits across EJ and non-EJ communities. For additional details on Agenda item 7, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:44:55.

Advisory Council/STMPR Advisory Group Member Comments:

Ana Gonzales asked how the avoided premature deaths estimated for 2022 AQMP compare to the 5,000 premature deaths associated with air pollution. Dr. Shen responded that the latter figure was based on CARB's analysis using historical data while the AQMP analysis projects health benefits for future years. Ms. Gonzales cited significant increases in truck traffic resulted from the expansion of warehouses in the Inland Empire and whether the associated air quality impacts are accounted for in the 2022 AQMP. Mr. MacMillan responded by affirming that warehouse industry growth is included in the projections outlined in the Revised Draft 2022 AQMP and noted projected decreases in per-truck emissions due to implementation of adopted and proposed regulations.

Mr. La Marr commented on the typographical errors for the estimated asthma related emergency room visits reduced. He also asked about how the avoided asthma incidence was estimated. Mr. Roman acknowledged the typographical errors and described the methodology and data sources.

Je-Show Yang asked how regulation and rule compliance was factored into the analysis. Mr. MacMillan responded that full compliance is typically assumed.

Mr. Chawkins expressed concern about insufficient meeting time for the remaining items on the agenda. Mr. MacMillan asked the participants whether to reschedule the remaining items for another time or to proceed with the remaining agenda items, and most participants indicated their preference to proceed. Mr. MacMillan added that the recorded meeting will be made available on the South Coast AQMD website.

Public Comments:

Ms. Wells commented on the need to further distinguish different racial/ethnic groups within the broad definition of “minority population” and that a community’s racial makeup changes over time. She then questioned whether there is a scientifically proven causal relationship between asthma and air pollution. Mr. Roman confirmed that projections take into account population demographics and movement/redistribution of the population throughout the region. He also cited scientific evidence on the causal relationship between ozone/PM2.5 levels and asthma.

8. Job Impacts of the Revised Draft 2022 AQMP

Dr. Peter Evangelakis, Senior Vice President/Regional Economic Models, Inc. (REMI), presented on the model used to simulate regional economic impacts. Dr. Shen presented on the employment impacts resulting from the Revised Draft 2022 AQMP. For additional details on Agenda item 8, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 2:33:26.

Public Comments:

Theral Golden, West Long Beach Association, asked about the health effects analysis underlying the job impacts associated with health benefits. Dr. Shen responded that the analysis was presented earlier and included in the Draft Socioeconomic Report for the 2022 AQMP.

9. Cost-Effectiveness

Mr. MacMillan presented on cost-effectiveness thresholds proposed in the Revised Draft 2022 AQMP. For additional details on Agenda item 9, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 2:48:01.

Advisory Council/STMPR Advisory Group Member Comments:

Mr. Rothbart asked whether the U.S. EPA quantifies its regulatory costs in the same way as how staff estimated the costs for the proposed control measures under the Federal Actions category. Mr. La Marr commented that a cost of \$325,000 per ton of NOx reduced will have a detrimental impact on small business.

Public Comments:

Ms. Wells commented that some racial/ethnic groups may be disproportionately impacted by more stringent regulation which is therefore a form of racism.

Bill Quinn, California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance (CCEEB), stated that their membership is fine with the proposed \$325,000/ton threshold and asked for clarification on how the threshold would be applied. Mr. MacMillan responded that it would serve as a screening threshold for additional analysis of alternatives to be discussed via a public process.

Advisory Council Members Present (19)

Adonis Galarza, Alianza Coachella Valley
Alfred Fraijo
Ana Gonzalez, Center for Community Action and Environmental Justice
Andrew Silva, San Bernardino County Resident
Bill La Marr, California Alliance of Small Business Associations
David Rothbart, The Los Angeles County Sanitation Districts and Southern California Alliance of Publicly Owned Treatment Works
Greg Ostermann, Jet Propulsion Laboratory, NASA
Irene Burga, GreenLatinos
Jennifer Bullard, Orange County Business Council
Je-Show Yang, Asian and Pacific Islander Forward Movement
Jo Kay Ghosh, Heluna Health
Ken Chawkins, Chawkins Communications Consulting
Michael Kleinman, University of California, Irvine
Natalie Hernandez, Climate Resolve
Paul Granillo Inland Empire Economic Partnership
Scott Weaver, Ramboll
Vanessa Delgado, (Board liaison) South Coast AQMD Governing Board
Yassi Kavezade, Sierra Club

STMPR Members Present (14)

Alex Gunther, University of California, Irvine
Anthony Oliver, CARB
Fred Lurmann, Sonoma Technology Inc.
Gabriele Pfister, National Center for Atmospheric Research
Gloria González-Rivera, University of California, Riverside
Greg Osterman, Jet Propulsion Laboratory/NASA
Jeremy Avise, CARB
John Cho, Southern California Association of Governments
Kelly Barsanti, University of California, Riverside
Ken Davidson, U.S. EPA Region IX
Pablo Saide, University of California, Los Angeles
Peter Evangelakis, REMI, Inc.
Ralph Morris, Ramboll
Robert Kleinhenz, Kleinhenz Economics

Public Attendees and Interested Parties (6)

Bill Quinn
James Enstrom
Kathleen Wells
Robert Silence
Shayne Seever
Theral Golden